



Implementation of the Cooperative Learning Model Type STAD (Student Team Achievement Division) to Improve Learning Outcomes in Islamic Religious Education and Character Education

Anis Putri Debi Anggraini¹, Ahmad Dhiyaa Ul Haqq^{1*}, Noor Akhmarisha Binti Sa'ari², Nanda Eska Anugrah Nasution¹

¹ UIN Kiai Haji Achmad Siddiq Jember, Indonesia

² School of Education and Cognitive Sciences Department, Asia E University, Malaysia

*Corresponding author: adhiyaaulhaqq@gmail.com

Abstract

Islamic Religious Education plays a crucial role in shaping Indonesian students into knowledgeable and morally upright individuals. However, many students struggle with its concepts, leading to poor academic performance. To address this, the study explores the implementation of the Student Team Achievement Division (STAD) cooperative learning model. STAD promotes collaboration in small, diverse teams, encouraging active participation and problem-solving. This research was conducted as a Classroom Action Research (CAR) study at SMP Negeri 2 Mayang Jember with seventh-grade students as participants. The study was carried out in two cycles, each comprising planning, implementation, observation, and reflection. The findings indicated a significant improvement in student learning outcomes after the application of STAD. The average student scores increased from 60 in the pre-test to 70 in the first cycle and further to 80 in the second cycle. The percentage of students achieving the minimum competency criteria rose from 11% in the pre-test to 75% by the end of the second cycle. These results suggest that the STAD model is an effective pedagogical approach for enhancing student learning outcomes in Islamic Religious Education. By creating an engaging and collaborative learning environment, STAD facilitates deeper understanding, promotes active participation, and fosters positive student interactions. Further research is recommended to explore its long-term impact and applicability to different subjects and educational levels.

Keywords: Cooperative Learning Model, Student Team Achievement Division, STAD, Learning Outcomes, Islamic Religious Education, Character Education

INTRODUCTION

Education is the cornerstone of human development and a vital factor in shaping a nation's intellectual and moral foundation (Nasution, [2024](#); Sholihah et al., [2024](#); Adha et al., [2019](#)). Among the various subjects taught in schools, Islamic Religious Education (IRE) holds a significant role in guiding students toward developing strong moral character, deep spiritual awareness, and a commitment to ethical values (Rohman, [2022](#); Idris et al., [2022](#)). The primary objective of IRE is to instill Islamic teachings in students,

History:

Received : January 29, 2025
Revised : May 9, 2025
Accepted : May 11, 2025
Published : May 13, 2025

Publisher: UIN Kiai Haji Achmad Siddiq Jember

Licensed: This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International](#) (CC BY 4.0)



enabling them to become responsible citizens who uphold religious and national values (Utari et al., [2020](#)). In Indonesia, IRE is a compulsory subject from elementary school to higher education, mandated by national educational policies to cultivate knowledgeable and morally upright individuals.

However, despite the importance of IRE, many students struggle to grasp its concepts, leading to suboptimal learning outcomes. Several factors contribute to this challenge, including traditional teaching methods that rely heavily on lectures, minimal student engagement, and a lack of interactive learning experiences (Mahmudah et al., [2024](#)). Studies have shown that students often become passive recipients of information, limiting their ability to internalize and apply religious teachings in their daily lives (Nurulhaji & Ariska, [2025](#)). To address this issue, innovative teaching approaches are necessary to create a more engaging and effective learning environment.

One such approach is cooperative learning, which emphasizes student collaboration and active participation (Nababan et al., [2023](#)). Cooperative learning models encourage students to work together in structured groups to achieve common learning objectives (Suriyanisa et al., [2024](#)). Among the various cooperative learning strategies, the Student Team Achievement Division (STAD) model has gained recognition for its effectiveness in improving student learning outcomes. STAD involves students working in small, heterogeneous teams where they engage in discussions, peer tutoring, and group-based assessments. This model fosters an interactive and supportive classroom environment, enhancing students' understanding and retention of course materials.

STAD is particularly well-suited for teaching IRE, as it aligns with the principles of teamwork, mutual support, and collective problem-solving—values that are deeply embedded in Islamic teachings (Syam, [2022](#)). Through collaborative learning, students can engage in meaningful discussions, clarify misconceptions, and reinforce their understanding of religious concepts. Good learning activities generally produce good learning outcomes too (Sanusi & Fauzi, [2024](#); Cantika et al., [2024](#)). Furthermore, the STAD model allows teachers to act as facilitators, guiding students through the learning process while encouraging autonomy and critical thinking.

This study investigates the implementation of the STAD model in improving student learning outcomes in IRE among seventh-grade students at SMP Negeri 2 Mayang Jember. The research aims to determine whether cooperative learning enhances student engagement, comprehension, and academic achievement. The study employs Classroom Action Research (CAR) methodology, consisting of two cycles with four key stages: planning, implementation, observation, and reflection (Coghlan, [2019](#)).

Prior to the intervention, preliminary observations indicated that many students exhibited low motivation and passive engagement during IRE lessons. The traditional lecture-based approach failed to stimulate student interest, resulting in poor retention and application of religious concepts. The pre-test results further confirmed these findings, with only 11% of students achieving the minimum competency criteria (KKM) and an average

score of 60. These results highlighted the need for an alternative instructional strategy to improve student learning outcomes.

During the first cycle of the study, the STAD model was introduced, and students were divided into small, diverse teams. Each team was assigned collaborative learning tasks that required discussion, problem-solving, and peer tutoring. The teacher facilitated the learning process by providing guidance, clarifying concepts, and encouraging active participation. At the end of the first cycle, the post-test results showed an improvement, with 22% of students meeting the KKM and an average score increase to 70. Although progress was evident, further enhancements were needed to maximize student performance.

In the second cycle, refinements were made to address the challenges observed in the first cycle. Additional support was provided to struggling students, and group discussions were made more structured to ensure equal participation. These modifications led to a remarkable improvement in student performance. By the end of the second cycle, 75% of students achieved the KKM, and the average score rose to 80. Students displayed increased enthusiasm, confidence, and a greater ability to articulate their understanding of Islamic teachings.

The findings of this study suggest that the STAD model is a highly effective instructional strategy for enhancing student learning outcomes in IRE. By fostering an engaging and collaborative classroom environment, STAD promotes deeper comprehension, critical thinking, and a sense of academic responsibility among students (Sejati & Widjajanti, [2024](#)). The cooperative nature of STAD not only strengthens students' grasp of religious concepts but also cultivates essential life skills such as teamwork, communication, and problem-solving (Astini & Purwati, [2020](#)).

In conclusion, the integration of cooperative learning models, particularly STAD, in Islamic Religious Education can significantly improve student engagement and academic achievement. This study provides compelling evidence that shifting from traditional teacher-centered methods to student-centered learning approaches yields positive results. Future research could explore the long-term impact of STAD in various educational contexts and investigate its applicability across different subjects and grade levels. Additionally, further studies could examine the role of teacher training and instructional design in optimizing the implementation of cooperative learning strategies.

By embracing innovative pedagogical approaches like STAD, educators can create more dynamic and effective learning experiences that empower students to succeed academically while reinforcing their moral and spiritual development.

METHOD

This study employs Classroom Action Research (CAR), which is a type of research conducted by teachers to improve the quality of learning in their classrooms. The selection of classroom action methods in research has been proven in various previous studies to be successful in solving student learning problems (Susanti et al., [2024](#); Mahmudah et al., [2024](#); Husniah et

al., [2024](#)). Therefore, CAR aims to enhance teaching practices and learning outcomes. This research was designed to evaluate the effectiveness of the Student Team Achievement Division (STAD) cooperative learning model in improving the learning outcomes of Islamic Religious Education and Character Education among seventh-grade students at SMP Negeri 2 Mayang Jember during the 2023/2024 academic year.

The research was conducted in class VII of SMP Negeri 2 Mayang Jember, located at Jl. Bromo No. 1, Mayang, Jember, East Java. The location was chosen due to the observed low learning outcomes among some students. The study took place during the even semester of the 2023/2024 academic year and consisted of two cycles, each comprising four stages: planning, implementation, observation, and reflection.

The study subjects included 28 students, comprising 16 males and 12 females. The research was implemented over two cycles to enhance student learning outcomes in Islamic Religious Education and Character Education. The research procedure followed a cyclical approach, where each cycle consisted of planning, implementation, observation, and reflection, as outlined by Suharsimi Arikunto.

During the planning stage, the researcher obtained permission from the school principal, conducted initial observations to identify problems, and prepared lesson plans, observation sheets, and evaluation instruments. Initial observations revealed that students exhibited low engagement levels and struggled with individual assessments.

The implementation stage involved delivering lessons using the STAD model, where students were divided into teams and engaged in collaborative learning activities. The STAD model required students to work in small groups, allowing them to support one another in understanding key concepts. The teacher facilitated discussions, provided guided instruction, and monitored group progress.

The observation stage involved monitoring student activities and teacher performance using structured observation sheets. The researcher documented student participation, teamwork, and responses to group-based learning activities. Student engagement was assessed based on their interaction within their teams and their ability to complete assigned tasks collaboratively.

Finally, in the reflection stage, the researcher and the teacher reviewed the results, identified areas for improvement, and planned necessary adjustments for the next cycle. Based on feedback from the first cycle, modifications included providing additional guidance to struggling students, refining assessment techniques, and increasing teacher support during group activities.

Data collection methods included observation, tests, interviews, and documentation. Observations focused on student engagement, teacher performance, and the effectiveness of the STAD model. Pre-tests and post-tests were administered to measure learning improvements. Interviews with students and teachers provided qualitative insights into their experiences, while documentation, such as lesson plans and student work, was used to

validate findings. The data were analyzed quantitatively using percentage-based calculations to measure learning progress and qualitatively through student feedback.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Results

The study was conducted over two cycles, with each cycle consisting of planning, implementation, observation, and reflection. The pre-test results revealed that only three out of 28 students (11%) met the minimum competency criteria (KKM) as shown in Table 1. The average pre-test score was 60, indicating a need for instructional improvement. Many students demonstrated difficulty understanding key concepts, particularly those related to Islamic Religious Education and Character Education.

Table 1. Learning completion percentage in pre-cycle.

No	Classical Learning Completion	Level of Completion	Number of Students	Total Percentage
1	≥ 75	Completed	3	11%
2	≤ 75	Incomplete	25	89%
Total			28	100%

In the first cycle, the STAD model was implemented, and students engaged in group-based learning activities. The results showed some improvement, with six students (22%) achieving scores above the KKM, and an average score increase to 70. However, 78% of students still did not meet the minimum criteria, indicating the need for further intervention as displayed in Table 2. Observations during the first cycle highlighted challenges such as student unfamiliarity with the cooperative learning process and limited active participation. Some students were hesitant to engage in discussions, while others struggled with the transition from individual learning to group-based tasks.

Table 2. Learning completion percentage after cycle I.

No	Classical Learning Completion	Level of Completion	Number of Students	Total Percentage
1	≥ 75	Completed	6	22%
2	≤ 75	Incomplete	22	78%
Total			28	100%

Based on the reflections from the first cycle, adjustments were made in the second cycle, including more structured group activities and increased teacher facilitation. Additional scaffolding was provided for students who struggled in the first cycle, such as targeted feedback and structured guidance. The results of the second cycle demonstrated significant improvement, with 21 students (75%) meeting the KKM, and the average score rising to 80. The observations indicated increased student engagement, better teamwork, and enhanced comprehension of the subject matter. Students appeared more confident in expressing their ideas and were more willing to engage in discussions with their peers.

Table 3. Learning completion percentage after cycle II.

No	Classical Learning Completion	Level of Completion	Number of Students	Total Percentage
1	≥ 75	Completed	21	75%
2	≤ 75	Incomplete	7	25%
Total			28	100%

Further analysis revealed that students who actively participated in group discussions tended to perform better on assessments. The STAD model encouraged peer teaching, where stronger students helped weaker ones, reinforcing their understanding of the material. This collaborative approach contributed to the improvement in overall learning outcomes.

Discussion

The findings of this study align with previous research on the Student Team Achievement Division (STAD) model, reinforcing the importance of cooperative learning in enhancing student outcomes. The implementation of the STAD model in this study followed a structured approach across two cycles. Each cycle comprised four phases: planning, implementation, observation, and reflection (Coghlan, [2019](#)). The instructional process was further divided into three key activities: introduction, core activities, and closure. These structured stages ensured that students received well-organized instruction and opportunities for collaborative learning.

The results of this study indicate a significant improvement in student learning outcomes from the first to the second cycle. In the pre-cycle phase, the average student score was 60, with only 11% of students meeting the minimum competency standard (KKM). Following the implementation of STAD in Cycle I, the average score increased to 70, with 22% of students achieving the competency threshold. By Cycle II, the average score further improved to 80, with 75% of students meeting or exceeding the KKM. These findings highlight the effectiveness of structured collaborative learning environments in fostering academic progress.

Observations revealed that the shift from individual learning to group-based activities significantly enhanced student engagement and confidence. Through the STAD model, students had the opportunity to work in heterogeneous groups, where they could discuss and solve problems collectively (Putri, [2024](#)). This interactive learning environment facilitated peer support, reinforced conceptual understanding, and encouraged active participation (Pratiwi et al., [2024](#)). Additionally, the cooperative setting reduced anxiety related to assessments and promoted a sense of responsibility among students regarding their learning (Tarigan, [2019](#)).

Student interviews provided further insights into the benefits of STAD. Many students reported that the cooperative learning approach made the classroom experience more enjoyable and engaging. They expressed increased motivation to participate in discussions and complete assigned tasks. The structured nature of STAD, which included clear guidance and

peer interaction, helped students develop problem-solving skills while fostering a positive learning atmosphere (Yekti, [2024](#)).

The teacher's role was instrumental in facilitating discussions, monitoring group progress, and providing structured feedback. The findings emphasize that clear instructions, active teacher guidance, and formative assessments are critical components of successful cooperative learning implementation. The observational data showed that the teacher's effectiveness in managing classroom activities improved from Cycle I to Cycle II, with instructional engagement scores increasing from 57.5% in the first cycle to 85% in the second cycle. This demonstrates the pivotal role of instructional strategies in enhancing student learning experiences.

Moreover, the structured guidance and feedback provided by the teacher played a crucial role in student success. The study found that students benefited from a well-defined learning process that encouraged collaboration and independent thinking. The shift toward student-centered learning not only improved immediate learning outcomes but also equipped students with critical thinking skills applicable beyond the classroom.

The STAD cooperative learning model effectively enhanced student learning outcomes in Islamic Religious Education at SMP Negeri 2 Mayang Jember. This is in line with various cooperative learning models in previous classroom action research which have also been proven to improve student learning outcomes (Gunawan et al., [2024](#); Khalik et al., [2024](#); Mas'ud et al., [2024](#)). The structured approach of STAD contributed to significant academic improvements, increased student engagement, and fostered a collaborative learning culture. Future research could explore the long-term impact of cooperative learning models across different subjects and educational levels. Additionally, further investigations could examine specific factors contributing to student success in cooperative learning environments, such as group composition, task complexity, and teacher facilitation techniques. Expanding the implementation of cooperative learning strategies beyond this study could provide deeper insights into how various student demographics respond to structured collaborative instruction.

CONCLUSIONS AND SUGGESTIONS

Based on the findings of this classroom action research and the discussion presented, it can be concluded that the implementation of the cooperative learning model, specifically the Student Team Achievement Division (STAD), has significantly improved the learning outcomes of seventh-grade students at SMP Negeri 2 Mayang Jember. The study focused on the topic of self-awareness and introspection in daily life. The results demonstrated a notable increase in student achievement, with only 11% of students meeting the minimum competency criteria in the pre-cycle stage, increasing to 22% in the first cycle, and reaching 75% in the second cycle. These findings confirm that the use of the STAD cooperative learning model in Islamic Religious Education has positively impacted student performance and engagement, making it an effective instructional strategy to enhance learning outcomes.

The findings of this research suggest that the STAD cooperative learning model can serve as a viable alternative teaching method for Islamic Religious Education and Character Education. Given its effectiveness in improving student learning outcomes, this approach can be recommended for broader implementation in similar educational contexts. Additionally, this study provides valuable insights for future research on instructional methods that aim to enhance student engagement and academic achievement. The results of this study may also serve as a reference for further research on cooperative learning models in different subject areas and educational levels.

ACKNOWLEDGE

The researchers would like to express their sincere gratitude to UIN Kiai Haji Achmad Siddiq Jember for providing academic support and resources throughout this study. Special thanks are also extended to SMP Negeri 2 Mayang Jember for granting permission to conduct this research and for the invaluable cooperation from the teachers, staff, and students. Their support and participation played a crucial role in the successful completion of this study. The researchers hope that this study will contribute to the ongoing efforts to enhance the quality of education through innovative and student-centered learning approaches.

REFERENCE

- Adha, M. A., Gordisona, S., Ulfatin, N., & Supriyanto, A. (2019). Analisis komparasi sistem pendidikan Indonesia dan Finlandia. *Public Health*, 27(6), 1-8. <https://doi.org/10.29240/jsmp.v3i2.1102>
- Astini, N. W., & Purwati, N. K. R. (2020). Strategi Pembelajaran Matematika Berdasarkan Karakteristik Siswa Sekolah Dasar. *Emasains*, 9(1), 1-8. <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.3742749>
- Cantika, L., Umam, K., & Syamsuddin. (2024). Peningkatan Kemampuan Membaca Huruf Hijaiyah dan Menghafal Surat Pendek melalui Metode Bermain Edukatif di TK Islam Terpadu Insan Kamil Purwakarta. *Journal of Pedagogical and Teacher Professional Development*, 1(1), 32-46. Retrieved from <https://jptpd.uinkhas.ac.id/index.php/jptpd/article/view/3>
- Coghlan, D. (2019). *Doing action research in your own organization*.
- Gunawan, W., Farichah, S. D., & Halim, A. (2024). Peningkatan Hasil Belajar Siswa pada Materi Keragaman melalui Model Problem Based Learning di Kelas IV SDN Sawahkulon Purwakarta. *Journal of Pedagogical and Teacher Professional Development*, 1(1), 134-146. Retrieved from <https://jptpd.uinkhas.ac.id/index.php/jptpd/article/view/27>
- Husniah, Royani, A., & Muafia, E. (2024). Peningkatan Hasil Belajar Siswa melalui Pembelajaran Interaktif pada Materi Huruf Hijaiyah Bersambung dan Harakat di Kelas II SD Negeri 1 Plalangan

- Situbondo. *Journal of Pedagogical and Teacher Professional Development*, 1(1), 160–169. Retrieved from <https://jptpd.uinkhas.ac.id/index.php/jptpd/article/view/29>
- Idris, M., Bin Tahir, S. Z., Wilya, E., Yusriadi, Y., & Sarabani, L. (2022). Availability and Accessibility of Islamic Religious Education Elementary School Students in Non-Muslim Base Areas, North Minahasa, Indonesia. *Education Research International*, 2022(1), 6014952. <https://doi.org/10.1155/2022/6014952>
- Khalik, A., Royani, A., & Muafia, E. (2024). Peningkatan Pemahaman Rukun Iman melalui Model Pembelajaran Kooperatif Tipe Think Pair Share (TPS) pada Siswa Kelas V SDN 5 Tanjung Kamal Situbondo. *Journal of Pedagogical and Teacher Professional Development*, 1(1), 94–104. Retrieved from <https://jptpd.uinkhas.ac.id/index.php/jptpd/article/view/17>
- Mahmudah, S., Muhith, A., & Afandi, A. (2024). Penerapan Metode Demonstrasi untuk Meningkatkan Hasil Belajar pada Materi Sujud Tilawah Kelas VII di SMP Negeri 1 Banyuglugur Situbondo. *Journal of Pedagogical and Teacher Professional Development*, 1(1), 119–133. Retrieved from <https://jptpd.uinkhas.ac.id/index.php/jptpd/article/view/25>
- Mas'ud, M., Royani, A., & Muafia, E. (2024). Peningkatan Pemahaman Siswa terhadap Q.S. Al-Hujurat/49:13 dan Hadis tentang Keragaman melalui Model Pembelajaran Kontekstual di Kelas IV SDN 7 Pesisir Situbondo. *Journal of Pedagogical and Teacher Professional Development*, 1(1), 147–159. Retrieved from <https://jptpd.uinkhas.ac.id/index.php/jptpd/article/view/28>
- Nababan, D., Rambe, H. A. R., & Sitorus, L. D. W. (2023). Pengaruh Model Pembelajaran Kooperatif Dalam Kegiatan Belajar Mengajar Di Dalam Kelas. *MERDEKA: Jurnal Ilmiah Multidisiplin*, 1(1), 259-264. <https://doi.org/10.62017/merdeka.v1i1.545>
- Nasution, N. E. A. (2024). Development of a Digital Escape Room-Assisted E-Book in Environmental Science Courses. *Indonesian Journal of Mathematics and Natural Science Education*, 5(2), 104-121. <https://doi.org/10.35719/mass.v5i2.210>
- Nurulhaji, F. A., & Ariska, M. (2025). Transformasi Pemikiran Siswa Melalui Pendekatan Rasional-Kritis dalam Pembelajaran Akidah Akhlak di Madrasah Aliyah Hamasatul Muslimin Indonesia. *Pratyaksa: Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan, Sosial dan Humaniora*, 1(1), 31-41.
- Pratiwi, B. A., Sumiyadi, S., & Nugroho, R. A. (2024). Pembelajaran diferensiasi berbasis proyek untuk pengembangan keterampilan menulis cerita pendek di SMP. *Jurnal Onoma: Pendidikan, Bahasa, Dan Sastra*, 10(3), 2998-3009. <https://doi.org/10.30605/onoma.v10i3.4035>
- Putri, D. G. (2024). Peningkatan Hasil Belajar Materi Fikih Melalui Metode Student Teams Achievement Divisions (STAD) Dikelas 4 SDN 28 Sungai Lansek. *EduSpirit: Jurnal Pendidikan Kolaboratif*, 1(4), 85-92. <http://dx.doi.org/10.24127/jlpp.v9i2.3754>

- Rohman, F. (2022). Problem Based Learning in Islamic Religious Education: The Case of the Indonesian Pesantren. *Global Journal Al-Thaqafah*, 12(1), 82-97. <https://doi.org/10.7187/GJAT072022-5>
- Sanusi, U., & Fauzi, I. (2024). Peningkatan Hasil Belajar Materi Sujud Syukur, Sahwi, dan Tilawah melalui Metode Demonstrasi Pada Siswa Kelas VII Semester 1 SMPN 3 Klari. *Journal of Pedagogical and Teacher Professional Development*, 1(1), 1–15. Retrieved from <https://jptpd.uinkhas.ac.id/index.php/jptpd/article/view/10>
- Sejati, E. O. W., & Widjajanti, D. B. (2024). Pembelajaran kooperatif dalam pendekatan penemuan terbimbing ditinjau dari prestasi belajar, kemampuan berpikir kritis, dan kepercayaan diri. *PYTHAGORAS: Jurnal Matematika dan Pendidikan Matematika*, 14(2), 150-162. <https://doi.org/10.21831/pg.v14i2.26420>
- Sholihah, L. R., Nasution, N. E. A., & Rizka, C. (2024). Analysis of Peer Friendship, Learning Interests, and Biology Learning Results of Class X Students at Plus Bustanul Ulum Puger Jember Senior High School. *META: Journal of Science and Technological Education*, 3(1), 76-88. <https://meta.amiin.or.id/index.php/meta/article/view/97/39>
- Suriyanisa, S., Syamsuri, S., Ramadhan, I., & Wijaya, T. (2024). Implementasi Model Koperatif Tipe Jigsaw Berbasis Padlet Pada Pembelajaran Sosiologi untuk Meningkatkan Kerja Sama Peserta Didik Kelas XI di SMA Negeri 1 Pontianak. *Didaktika: Jurnal Kependidikan*, 13(2), 2227-2240. <https://doi.org/10.58230/27454312.558>
- Susanti, A., Royani, A., & Muafia, E. (2024). Penerapan Metode Cerita Moral dalam Meningkatkan Pemahaman Akhlak Terpuji pada Siswa Kelas III di SD Negeri 1 Besuki Situbondo. *Journal of Pedagogical and Teacher Professional Development*, 1(1), 105–118. Retrieved from <https://jptpd.uinkhas.ac.id/index.php/jptpd/article/view/18>
- Syam, N. (2022). *Penggunaan Strategi Pembelajaran Kooperatif Tipe STAD (Student Teams Achievement Division) dalam Meningkatkan Minat Belajar Peserta Didik Pada Mata Pelajaran Akidah Akhlak Di Kelas VIII MTs. Negeri 1 Sidenreng Rappang* (Doctoral dissertation, IAIN PAREPARE).
- Tarigan, R. B. (2019). *Pengaruh model pembelajaran kooperatif dan kecerdasan emosional terhadap tanggung jawab siswa dalam mata pelajaran pendidikan jasmani olahraga yayasan pendidikan SMP Santo Xaverius 1 Kabanjahe* (Doctoral dissertation, Universitas Medan Area).
- Utari, L., Kurniawan, K., & Fathurrochman, I. (2020). Peran Guru Pendidikan Agama Islam dalam Membina Akhlak Peserta Didik Autis. *JOEAI (Journal of Education and Instruction)*, 3(1), 75-89. <https://doi.org/10.31539/joeai.v3i1.1304>
- Yekti, C. S. H. (2024). *Analisis Model Pembelajaran Kooperatif Tipe Student Team Achievement Division Dalam Mencegah Perilaku Kontraproduktif Siswa SD* (Doctoral dissertation, Universitas Islam Sultan Agung Semarang).